Claim Checking and Disinformation

CREDWEB MEETING – MAY 27TH, 2020

DANIEL SCHWABE
Claim Checking structure (simplified)
Example


**Trump's driver's license casts doubt on height claims**

By DARRENSAMUELSOHN | 12/23/2016 09:36 AM EST

Donald Trump is listed as 6-foot-2 on his driver's license.

A copy of Trump's license, obtained by POLITICO through an open-records request, lists the president-elect at 6-foot-2.
Donald Trump's height is 6'3'' claims supports

Donald Trump's height is 6'3'' claims contradicts

Donald Trump's height is 6'2'' claims

Donald Trump, author

Interview

Memo

Driver's License

Sean P. Conley, author

NY DMV, author

https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefings/statements/memorandum-physician-president-2/
Example 2 (metadata)

Deputy comes across alligator in the street in Fort Bend County

Heather Leighton | April 18, 2017

Look who wandered into my friend’s Houston Thunderstorm? Everyone affected by Harvey and they’re safe.

5:18 PM, Aug 27, 2017

Katie Couric @katiecouric

Claim check process

• Dispute of Narratives

• Involves a chain of trust
  • Must be anchored
    ◦ Direct experience
    ◦ Social conventions – laws, norms, religion

• Consumption by user
  • Purpose (action?)
    ◦ “Faith”
  • Structure of the narrative
    ◦ Argumentation
  • Elements of the narrative
    ◦ Agents, sources
  • Presentation
What is trust?

Social Media/News = a world of Agents.

Trust as a social process.

Some properties of trust

- It only matters when some action is involved (Castelfranchi’s delegation)
- It is binary! You can’t “half trust”, because you can’t “half act”
- It is held towards some agent regarding some “matter”.

*Gerck:* “Trust is knowledge-based reliance on received information”.

- Models of Trust x Trust Models
Trust Process

Data/Information

- Metada
- Context
- Policies

Trust Process

Agent

Trusted Data/Information

Action
No Daddy, this is Fake News!

But how can it be Fake if it says exactly what I think?!!!
Questions for discussion

- How do we relate to Value systems?

- Does additional info make a difference?
  - “How politics makes us stupid”

- People do change positions

- Check the “fact checkers”?
  - Petter Bae Brandtzaeg & Asbjørn Følstad, “Trust and Distrust in Online Fact-Checking Services”, Communications of the ACM, forthcoming

- Fake checkers!
Thanks!

References:


dschwabe@gmail.com